

REPORT OF INDEPENDENT CERTIFIED PUBLIC ACCOUNTANTS

To the Management of Internet Security Research Group:

Scope

We have examined the <u>assertion by the management</u> of the Internet Security Research Group ("ISRG") that in providing its SSL Certification Authority (CA) services at its Salt Lake City, Utah, and Denver, Colorado, locations for its root and subordinate CA certificates:

- C=US O=Internet Security Research Group CN=ISRG Root X1
 96:BC:EC:06:26:49:76:F3:74:60:77:9A:CF:28:C5:A7:CF:E8:A3:C0:AA:E1:1A:8F:FC:EE:05:C0:BD:DF:08:C6
- C=US O=Internet Security Research Group CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X1

 BD:EE:0D:7C:8F:9C:27:8F:14:EA:9B:6A:4F:90:ED:66:5A:9F:56:DB:0A:56:B1:CD:DA:67:65:91:2F:39:
 8A:5E
- C=US O=Internet Security Research Group CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X2
 E4:EB:54:A7:FF:A5:52:EF:64:D8:E1:AE:33:8B:69:BE:90:9C:29:E6:AF:57:17:0A:2F:6F:44:DF:22:5E:5
 A:14
- C=US O=Let's Encrypt CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X3
 73:1D:3D:9C:FA:A0:61:48:7A:1D:71:44:5A:42:F6:7D:F0:AF:CA:2A:6C:2D:2F:98:FF:7B:3C:E1:12:B1: F5:68
- C=US O=Let's Encrypt CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X4
 5D:E9:15:2B:ED:31:FA:05:15:DD:1F:C7:46:13:3F:13:27:56:2E:F7:2A:84:CF:2D:24:03:E7:48:A6:04:D
 0:D4

for the program known as Let's Encrypt during the period from December 16, 2016, to December 15, 2017, management of ISRG has:

- Disclosed its SSL Certificate practices and its commitment to provide SSL Certificates in conformity with the applicable CA/Browser Forum Requirements within its Certificate Policy (v2.0) and Certification Practice Statement (v2.0);
- Maintained effective controls to provide reasonable assurance that:
 - Subscriber information was properly collected, authenticated (for the registration activities performed by the CA, Registration Authority (RA) and subcontractor) and verified;
 - The integrity of keys and certificates it manages is established and protected throughout their life cycles;
 - Logical and physical access to CA systems and data was restricted to authorized individuals;
 - The continuity of key and certificate management operations was maintained;
 - CA systems development, maintenance, and operations were properly authorized and performed to maintain CA systems integrity; and
 - It meets the Network and Certificate System Security Requirements as set forth by the CA/Browser Forum

based on the <u>AICPA/CPA Canada WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities – SSL Baseline with</u> Network Security – Version 2.2.

ISRG's Responsibilities

ISRG's management is responsible for its assertion. Our responsibility is to express an opinion on management's assertion based on our examination.

Independent Certified Public Accountant's Responsibilities

Our examination was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants, and accordingly, included (1) obtaining an understanding of ISRG's key and SSL certificate life cycle management business practices and its controls over key and SSL certificate integrity, over the authenticity and privacy of subscriber and relying party information, over the continuity of key and certificate life cycle management operations, and over development, maintenance and operation of systems integrity; (2) selectively testing transactions executed in accordance with disclosed key and certificate life cycle management business and information privacy practices; (3) testing and evaluating the operating effectiveness of the controls; and (4) performing such other procedures as we considered necessary in the circumstances. We believe that our examination provides a reasonable basis for our opinion.

Inherent Limitations

Because of the nature and inherent limitations of controls, ISRG's ability to meet the aforementioned criteria may be affected. For example, controls may not prevent, or detect and correct, error, fraud, unauthorized access to systems and information, or failure to comply with internal and external policies or requirements. Also, the projection of any conclusions based on our findings to future periods is subject to the risk that changes may alter the validity of such conclusions.

Emphasis on a Matter

ISRG has disclosed that its Certificate Authority Authorization (CAA) checking algorithm was modified on September 14, 2017 to meet the new CAA checking rules that were added to the Baseline Requirements and went into effect on September 8, 2017.

Opinion

In our opinion, for the period from December 16, 2016, to December 15, 2017, ISRG's management's assertion, as set forth in the first paragraph, is fairly stated, in all material respects, based on the <u>AICPA/CPA Canada WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities – SSL Baseline with Network Security – Version 2.2.</u>

The WebTrust seal of assurance for Certification Authorities on ISRG's website constitutes a symbolic representation of the contents of this report and it is not intended, nor should it be construed, to update this report or provide any additional assurance.

The relative effectiveness and significance of specific controls at ISRG and their effect on assessments of control risk for subscribers and relying parties are dependent on their interaction with the controls, and other factors present at external registration authorities, individual subscriber and relying party locations. We have performed no procedures to evaluate the effectiveness of controls at external registration authorities, individual subscriber and relying party locations.

This report does not include any representation as to the quality of ISRG's services beyond those covered by the AICPA/CPA Canada WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities – SSL Baseline with Network Security – Version 2.2, nor the suitability of any of ISRG's services for any customer's intended purpose.

Schellman & Company, LLC Certified Public Accountants

4010 W Boy Scout Blvd., Suite 600

Scheuman & Company, LLC

Tampa, FL 33607 January 25, 2018



ASSERTION BY MANAGEMENT AS TO ITS DISCLOSURE OF ITS PRACTICES AND ITS CONTROLS OVER ITS SSL CERTIFICATION AUTHORITY OPERATIONS DURING THE PERIOD FROM DECEMBER 16, 2016, TO DECEMBER 15, 2017

January 25, 2018

Management has assessed the controls over its SSL CA operations. Based on that assessment, in ISRG management's opinion, in providing its SSL CA services at its Salt Lake City, Utah, and Denver, Colorado, locations, for its root and subordinate CA certificates:

- C=US O=Internet Security Research Group CN=ISRG Root X1
 96:BC:EC:06:26:49:76:F3:74:60:77:9A:CF:28:C5:A7:CF:E8:A3:C0:AA:E1:1A:8F:FC:EE:05:C0:BD:DF:08:C6
- C=US O=Internet Security Research Group CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X1

 BD:EE:0D:7C:8F:9C:27:8F:14:EA:9B:6A:4F:90:ED:66:5A:9F:56:DB:0A:56:B1:CD:DA:67:65:91:2F:39:
 8A:5E
- C=US O=Internet Security Research Group CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X2
 E4:EB:54:A7:FF:A5:52:EF:64:D8:E1:AE:33:8B:69:BE:90:9C:29:E6:AF:57:17:0A:2F:6F:44:DF:22:5E:5
 A:14
- C=US O=Let's Encrypt CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X3
 73:1D:3D:9C:FA:A0:61:48:7A:1D:71:44:5A:42:F6:7D:F0:AF:CA:2A:6C:2D:2F:98:FF:7B:3C:E1:12:B1: F5:68
- C=US O=Let's Encrypt CN=Let's Encrypt Authority X4
 5D:E9:15:2B:ED:31:FA:05:15:DD:1F:C7:46:13:3F:13:27:56:2E:F7:2A:84:CF:2D:24:03:E7:48:A6:04:D
 0:D4

for the program known as Let's Encrypt, during the period from December 16, 2016, to December 15, 2017, ISRG:

- Disclosed its SSL Certificate practices and its commitment to provide SSL Certificates in conformity with the applicable CA/Browser Forum Requirements within its Certificate Policy (v2.0) and Certification Practice Statement (v2.0);
- Maintained effective controls to provide reasonable assurance that:
 - Subscriber information was properly collected, authenticated (for the registration activities performed by the CA, Registration Authority (RA) and subcontractor) and verified;
 - The integrity of keys and certificates it manages is established and protected throughout their life cycles;
 - Logical and physical access to CA systems and data was restricted to authorized individuals;
 - The continuity of key and certificate management operations was maintained;
 - CA systems development, maintenance, and operations was properly authorized and performed to maintain CA systems integrity; and
 - It meets the Network and Certificate System Security Requirements as set forth by the CA/Browser Forum

based on the <u>AICPA/CPA Canada WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities – SSL Baseline with Network Security – Version 2.2.</u>

In addition to the above, Management has disclosed that its Certificate Authority Authorization (CAA) checking algorithm was modified on September 14, 2017 to meet the new CAA checking rules that were added to the Baseline Requirements and went into effect on September 8, 2017.

Joshua Aas

Executive Director

The Internet Security Research Group